How Can We Develop and Sustain More Exemplary Teaching & Learning (and be recognized for doing so)?

Dr. Thomas Carey

tcarey@mail.sdsu.edu
How Can We Develop and Sustain More Exemplary Teaching & Learning (and be recognized for doing so)?

Dr. Thomas Carey
Executive-in-Residence for T&L Innovation
tcarey@mail.sdsu.edu

Blog: https://insidehighered.com/users/thomas-carey

Webpage: linkedin.com/in/drthomascarey

Twitter: @thoscarey
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments

Result in high-quality outcomes for students
+ achieve broader impacts, including:

- Serve as an exemplar of *signature capabilities* for our students
- Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by our teaching colleagues
- Contribute to inter-institutional networks to advance teaching quality
- Serve as a beacon of globally exemplary work for others in the region

*Status: Hypotheses, with promising work-in-progress examples*
What Prompted a Focus Beyond Student Outcomes?

From a Deputy VC: “Why should I invest more in teaching when the impact will not be felt beyond our own classes?”

From a Deputy Minister: “How can we ensure that investments in teaching quality continue to enhance learning after funding ends?”

From all our Universities: “We have an excellent teaching & learning environment”
Another comment in a meeting with government officials

Quoting Warren Buffett on government funding of teaching quality initiatives:

“You can’t tell who’s been swimming naked until the tide goes out”
One phrase I’d like to avoid...
The Melbourne Graduate School of Science is part of a world-class, internationally recognised institution.

Janet Clarke Hall offers a world-class university experience which equips our students for their studies, and the world beyond.

Melbourne School of Information
IT at Melbourne is world class...

The Melbourne Graduate School of Science is part of a world class, internationally recognised institution...

The University
Find out about upcoming events, the student experience at Melbourne, support services available and our world-class reputation.
World Class University - Nashville, Tennessee

World Class University located in Nashville, Tennessee. Find statistics, maps ...
One phrase I’d like to avoid...

Globally Exemplary

Working Definition (2016/09/30):

A globally-exemplary institution in teaching and learning is...

• **Prominent** internationally as an **Innovator**
  • amongst the global leaders in a particular outcome

• **Recognized** nationally as a **Leader** by peer institutions

• Leveraged as an **Exemplar regionally**
  • systematically and proactively in a cooperative network
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments will...

• Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by colleagues
  • Serve as an exemplar of *signature outcomes* for students
  • Contribute to inter-institutional networks to advance teaching quality
  • Serve as a beacon of globally exemplary work for others in the region
You already know about exemplary practices and resources...

**UQ murder mystery scoops international award**

10 May 2016
The psychology of crime and justice has fascinated people for centuries – and it continues to do so, with the University of Queensland’s CRIME101x online course winning an international award.

Created and taught by Associate Professors Blake McKimmie, Barbara Masser and Mark Horswill from the School of Psychology, CRIME101x uses an innovative mix of drama and interactive learning to identify ways the criminal justice system can be improved.

*Almost 40,000 students from around the world have...*
4D Construction Learning Environment

a unique view on the construction process
explore fully interactive panoramic views of the construction site

http://4dconstruction.architecture.uq.edu.au/

http://serc.carleton.edu/mathyouneedecon/graphs/index.html
How Can We Promote Use of Exemplary Resources & Practices?

Promising work-in-progress example:
• gradually raise expectations for knowledge syntheses as design rationales in Course Approval and Program Review Processes
Canadian university’s course approval for an Interdisciplinary Amazon Field School

...students engage in creative, cultural and immersion activities; and contextualize their field learning by classroom-based analysis and critical reflection before and after their field experiences...
Sample research references cited in the Course Description

Higher Education Research & Development

A research-based approach to generic graduate attributes policy

Simon C. Barrie*
University of Sydney, Australia

Interview Strategies for Assessing Self-Authorship: Constructing Conversations to Assess Meaning Making

Marcia B. Baxter Magolda, Patricia M. King
Sample outcome specification & rubric from Course Description

**Intercultural Empathy:** Apply an understanding of cultural differences to create shared meaning based on those differences.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Initial benchmark</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learners may only partially and superficially understand cultural differences, primarily through first impressions and</td>
<td>Learners have become aware of significant and subtle cultural differences between their own culture and the new culture</td>
<td>Learners have begun to make sense of cultural differences and appreciate, respect, and behave sensitively towards the new</td>
<td>Learners demonstrate the ability to truly empathize with the other culture’s perspective, viewing it from the inside and use this</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Additional research references suggested by external sources

Transformational learning through study abroad: US students’ reflections on learning about sustainability in the South Pacific

The effect of short-term educational travel programs on environmental citizenship

The Educational Value of Short-Term Study Abroad Programs as Course Components

Global Citizenship as a Learning Outcome of Educational Travel

Applying a transformative learning framework to volunteer tourism
Start with a Knowledge Synthesis:

- research evidence, exemplary practice & emerging innovations on developing capability in emerging learning & knowledge practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specify</th>
<th>Engage</th>
<th>Develop &amp; Demonstrate</th>
<th>Assess &amp; documentT</th>
<th>Enhance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>expected Graduate Attributes</td>
<td>students by motivating the development of the capabilities</td>
<td>student capabilities (with formative feedback)</td>
<td>(with summative evaluation)</td>
<td>all elements for future improvements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SPE E D D A T E

= SPEED DATE workshops for faculty and for Students as Partners

Adapted from http://assuringgraduatecapabilities.com/
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments will...

Result in high-quality outcomes for students
+ achieve broader impacts, including...

• Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by our teaching colleagues

• **Serve as an exemplar for students** of *signature capabilities*

• Contribute to inter-institutional networks to advance teaching quality

• Serve as a beacon of globally exemplary work for others in the region
Good teaching cannot be reduced to just technique: good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher:

How we teach is a key part of what we teach

How can faculty engagement with knowledge for teaching be a model for students’ engagement with knowledge in their careers...?
Modeling Metacognition in our Work as Teachers

Example: a consortium of liberal arts colleges in Pennsylvania

- Implemented metacognitive strategies (2012)
- Created the *Academy for Metacognition* (2013)
- Created a rubric (2014)
- **Tested the rubric** (2014)
  - Wrote reflective journals
  - Collaborated with colleagues
  - Considered revisions

### Reflective Planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptor</th>
<th>Planning classroom activities focuses on course content.</th>
<th>Planning classroom engagement activities occurs some of the time.</th>
<th>Planning classroom engagement activities is consistent and builds on students’ prior knowledge and experience.</th>
<th>Planning classroom engagement activities reflects the ongoing needs of the students and builds on students’ prior knowledge and experience.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Implementation of Lesson

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptor</th>
<th>The instructor occasionally utilizes timelines and makes relevant connections with concurrent events which are provided in texts and other sources.</th>
<th>The instructor frequently incorporates comparisons and contrasts from related disciplines.</th>
<th>The instructor regularly presents course concepts within broad context of diverse disciplines.</th>
<th>The instructor consciously incorporates cross-disciplinary connections and activities throughout class execution.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Reflection on Lesson

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptor</th>
<th>Reflection is somewhat perfunctory and lacks clarity with respect to student learning outcomes.</th>
<th>The instructor reflects minimally upon the classroom experience and is able to identify activities that were successful and those that were not successful.</th>
<th>The instructor reflects on his/her own effectiveness and is able to identify reflective practices by sharing, facilitating or modeling in professional learning communities.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

We focused on metacognitive strategies for...
“Graduates of the University...have a stance towards knowledge, the world, & themselves that sets them apart from other graduates in their lives & work”

develop knowledge, leadership skills and innovative mindsets to build meaningful networks, create agile careers and put ideas in motion...who are ready for the new-world workplace...use their intellectual assets to...become effective leaders, and turn their ideas into impact.

graduates...have a scholarly attitude to knowledge and understanding...be global citizens, who aspire to contribute to society in a full and meaningful way...lifelong learners committed to and capable of continuous learning and reflection

research and reasoning skills that equip graduates to be influential citizens with high leadership potential...engage with national and global issues and are attuned to social and cultural diversity. They have high levels of self-awareness and value their personal integrity and well-being.
“Graduates of the University...have a stance towards knowledge, the world, &
themselves that sets them apart from other graduates in their lives & work”

“...develop knowledge, leadership skills and
innovative mindsets to build meaningful
networks, create agile careers and put
ideas in motion...who are ready for the
new-world workplace...use their
intellectual assets to...become effective
leaders, and turn their ideas into impact.

Graduates...have a scholarly attitude
to knowledge and understanding...be
global citizens, who aspire to
contribute to society in a full and
meaningful way...lifelong learners
committed to and capable of
continuous learning and reflection

research and reasoning skills that equip
graduates to be influential citizens with
high leadership potential...engage with
national and global issues and are attuned
to social and cultural diversity. They have
high levels of self-awareness and value
their personal integrity and well-being.
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments will...

Result in high-quality outcomes for students

+ achieve broader impacts, including...

• Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by our teaching colleagues

• Serve as an exemplar for students of *signature capabilities*

beyond disciplinary outcomes & generic attributes:

How will our students stand out?
future capabilities

creativity and innovation

complex problem solving

complex collaboration and interactions

lifelong professional learning and relearning

enterprise & entrepreneurship

career self-management

digital creation & manipulation of digital tools

social network navigation and management

Although we are very good at using them... in our scholarly lives!

Can we get equally good at using them... in our teaching lives?
Innovation Capability:
the integration of knowledge, skills, experiences and mindsets
to engage effectively with Innovation Practices at the individual and
team levels and Innovation Processes at the organizational level.

Likely to emerge at two attribute levels:
- Innovation Readiness, developed and demonstrated by all graduates
- Innovation Catalysts, as an optional qualification or credential.

Pilot in the Bergeron Entrepreneurs in Science and Technology program

BEST EPIC pilot project
Innovation Readiness (for all graduates):
the capability to identify and engage with innovations to improve our lives.

TEN TYPES OF INNOVATION

THE BUILDING BLOCKS OF BREAKTHROUGHS

Profit Model Network Structure Process Product Performance Product System Service Channel Brand Customer Engagement

CONFIGURATION OFFERING EXPERIENCE
Innovation Catalysts (as a graduate specialty): the capability – knowledge, skills, experiences and mindsets – to support others in productive engagement with innovations.

Innovation, what innovation? A comparison between product, process and organizational innovation

Harry Boer and Willem E. During
Aalborg University Centre for Industrial Production, Fibigerstraede 16,

Strengthening Innovation Capacity through Different Types of Innovation Cultures
Jens-Uwe Meyer
Start with a Knowledge Synthesis:

- research evidence, exemplary practice & emerging innovations on developing capability in emerging learning & knowledge practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specify</th>
<th>Engage</th>
<th>Develop &amp; Demonstrate</th>
<th>Assess &amp; documentT</th>
<th>Enhance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>expected Graduate Attributes</td>
<td>students by motivating the development of the capabilities</td>
<td>student capabilities (with formative feedback)</td>
<td>(with summative evaluation)</td>
<td>all elements for future improvements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from http://assuringgraduateCapabilities.com/
Innovation Capability: the integration of knowledge, skills, experiences, and mindsets to engage effectively with Innovation Practices at the individual and team levels and Innovation Processes at the organizational level.

Pilot in the Bergeron Entrepreneurs in Science and Technology program

Likely to emerge at two attribute levels:
- **Innovation Readiness**, developed and demonstrated by all graduates
- **Innovation Catalysts**, as an optional qualification or credential.

**Requires educators demonstrating Innovation Capability in teaching!!**

**BEST EPIC pilot project**
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments will...

- Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by colleagues
- Serve as an exemplar of *signature outcomes* for students
- **Contribute to cooperative networks to advance teaching**
- Serve as a beacon of globally exemplary work for others in the region

“collaboration to create value...competition in putting it to use”
Modeling Metacognition in our Work as Teachers

Example: a consortium of liberal arts colleges in Pennsylvania
Define “micro-competencies” and “micro-credentials” for Graduate Attributes

CRITICAL THINKING: Using logical thought processes to analyze and draw conclusions

- Identify inconsistent or missing information
- Critically review, analyze, synthesize, compare and interpret information
- Draw conclusions from relevant and/or missing information
- Test possible hypotheses to ensure the problem is correctly diagnosed and the best solution is identified

Example: research universities in the Washington D.C. area
How might we assess, measure and guide a student's 21st century skills development within or beyond a university degree?
Caveat: No Unbundling without “Rebundling”

Open and Integrative: Designing Liberal Education for the New Digital Ecosystem

Going beyond "unbundling", we propose that we use networked and adaptive systems to "re-bundle" higher education by connecting learning experiences that have typically been disconnected... and creating new integrative contexts for transformative learning.

Randy Bass & Bret Eynon
Changemaker Campus is a community of leaders and institutions who work collectively to make social innovation and changemaking the new norm in higher education and beyond. The Changemaker Campus program selects diverse institutions who:

- Represent higher education globally,
- Model campus-wide excellence in social innovation; and
- Are committed to transforming the field of higher education through collaboration.

http://ashokau.org/changemakercampus/

http://aascuglobalchallenges.org/  http://www.enhancementthemes.ac.uk/
Co-operative Innovation Network for Teaching & Learning

• Four pilot institutions, each *Excellent* in a *Signature Graduate Attribute*
• Share (tested) developments as an *Exemplar* with partner institutions, for an Ontario higher ed CINTL for emerging learning & knowledge practices
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments will...

- Serve as an exemplar of signature outcomes for students
- Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by colleagues
- Contribute to cooperative networks to advance teaching
- Serve as a beacon of globally exemplary work for others
CLASS OF 2030

Long Term Priorities
(7-20 years)

Differentiated Excellence
Global, Social, and Local

Integrated Planning

Short Term Priorities
(1-6 years)

Differentiated Excellence
“The Class of 2030 know what makes them special in a specialised global marketplace — and invest in it consistently”

Global, Social, Local
“The Class of 2030 know their market, capitalise on global trends and serve their students and communities — they make a difference on topics that matter”

Integrated Planning
“The Class of 2030 take long-term strategic planning seriously — with an inclusive focus on development, implementation and innovation”

People and Culture
“The Class of 2030 will attract and develop excellent staff — both as teachers and researchers — and trust them as excellent managers”

Academic Entrepreneurs
“The Class of 2030 are creative in finding new sources of revenue to match their ambitions — but recognise their constraints”
How Can We Develop and Sustain More Exemplary Teaching & Learning (and be recognized for doing so)?

Dr. Thomas Carey
tcarey@mail.sdsu.edu

Blog: https://insidehighered.com/users/thomas-carey
Twitter @thoscarey

Is the Future of Liberal Arts Programs “K-Shaped”?
September 15, 2016 - 6:02pm
By Thomas Carey

Recognizing and Rewarding Exemplary Teaching (not just Excellent Teaching)
Exemplary Teaching & Learning Environments will...

Result in high-quality outcomes for students

+ achieve broader impacts, including...

- Serve as an exemplar of *signature capabilities* for our students
- Serve as an exemplar for adaptation by our teaching colleagues
- Contribute to inter-institutional networks to advance teaching quality
- Serve as a beacon of globally exemplary work for others in the region

*Status: Hypotheses, with promising work-in-progress examples*
Optional Topics (today or later 😊)

• More on knowledge-intensive Course Approval & Program Review
• More on knowledge practices as a signature outcome in HASS
• More on region-serving and practice-oriented universities
• Other examples of emerging learning & knowledge practices
• Excellent teaching, expert teaching & exemplary teaching
• Engaging students in the importance of your signature capabilities
• Demonstrating signature capabilities to stakeholders (esp. government)
Mobilizing Knowledge Practices in Course Approval and Program Review
What we expect to learn in this session

- how can we use our institution’s formal processes as opportunities to integrate & mobilize SOTL results

- examples from **Course Approval** and **Program Review**

- how can we collaborate to explore further examples of integrating and mobilizing SOTL results

SOTL output from the Course Approval process 😊
Stages in **Program Review Process (KPU)**

- **Internal Self-Study**
- **External Review**
- **Action Plan**
- **Institutional Response**
- **Follow-up (1 year later)**
Sample references used in the FDTN Program Review

**Leadership**

*Undergraduate Excellence In Leadership Scoring Rubric*  
St Cloud University (MN)

**Creativity**

*Design students’ experience of engagement and creativity*  
Anna Reid and Ian Solomonides  
*Macquarie University*

**Assessment**

*Intersections: The utility of an ‘Assessment for Learning’ discourse for Design educators*  
Erik Bohemia, Kerry Harman and Liz McDowell  
*Northumbria University*
Cooperative Innovation Networks for Teaching & Learning
Faculty of Humanities, Arts & Social Science at a practice-oriented university in B.C.

What are the “emerging learning and knowledge practices” in which liberal arts graduates could stand out in capability?

(in the Context of pervasive attention to transferable competencies)
T-SUMMIT 2016
TRANSFORMATIONAL APPROACHES TO CREATING T-SHAPED PROFESSIONALS

Is the Future of Liberal Arts Programs “K-Shaped”?
September 15, 2016 - 6:02pm
By Thomas Carey
What are the “emerging learning and knowledge practices” in which liberal arts graduates could stand out in capability?

Where can we be Exemplary?

- Mobilizing and Creating Knowledge in the workplace = “Knowledge-Intensive Work”
Faculty of Humanities, Arts & Social Science at a practice-oriented, region-serving university in B.C.

What are the “emerging learning and knowledge practices” in which liberal arts graduates could stand out in capability?

Where can we be Exemplary?

• Mobilizing and Creating Knowledge in the workplace = “Knowledge-Intensive Work”
  • Innovation Catalysts
  • Interdisciplinary Work?
Complex knowledge & epistemic fluency

**Epistemic fluency** – the capability to work with different kinds of knowledge and switch between different ways of knowing

*(Morrison & Collins ’96)*
Faculty of Humanities, Arts & Social Science at a practice-oriented, region-serving university in B.C.

What are the “emerging learning and knowledge practices” in which liberal arts graduates could stand out in capability?

Where can **we** be Exemplary?

- *Mobilizing and Creating Knowledge in the workplace* = “Knowledge-Intensive Work”
- *Innovation Catalysts*
- *Catalysts for individual Epistemic Literacy and collective Epistemic Fluency*
Use Faculty Work in Teaching as a Model

Good teaching cannot be reduced to just technique: good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher:

How we teach is a key part of what we teach

How can faculty engagement with knowledge for teaching be a model for students’ engagement with knowledge in their careers...?
Complex knowledge & epistemic fluency

**Epistemic fluency** – the capability to work with different kinds of knowledge and switch between different ways of knowing.

**University teaching as epistemic fluency:**

Frames, conceptual blending and experiential resources in teacher pedagogical and ICT choices

Lina Markauskaite
Why exemplary teaching:
• Excellent
• Expert
• Exemplary
• Larry Smith

• Larry Smith Distinguished Award